



Consultation

Organisation & Management

School Performance Management

Action by: 09/08/2006

Date of Issue: 17/05/2006

Ref: DfES/0497-2006BKT-EN

FIRST CLASS ADAPTABLE SUSTAINABLE

Teachers' Pension Scheme England and Wales:
Consultation



department for

education and skills

creating opportunity, releasing potential, achieving excellence

1.	Executive Summary	2
2.	A Joint Statement to Members	4
3.	Summary of Agreed Package of Reforms and Improvement	6
4.	The Proposals	7
4.1.	Timing – implementing the new arrangements	7
4.2.	Automatic scheme membership for those taking up new part-time appointments	9
4.3.	Salary used for calculating pension benefits	10
4.4.	Buying additional pension benefits	12
4.5.	Phased retirement	13
4.6.	Surviving partner benefits	15
4.7.	Ill health retirement benefits	17
4.8.	Possible additional flexibilities*	18
4.9.	Premature retirement and severance arrangements	19
4.10.	Contribution Rates	20
5.	How to Respond	21
5.1.	On-line	21
5.2.	Other options	21
6.	Additional Copies	21
7.	Plans for making results public	21
8	Consultation Response Form	22

*These and a number of detailed issues will be the subject of continuing negotiations between unions, employers and DfES during the consultation period.

1. Executive Summary

- 1.1. Ensuring a first class defined benefit (i.e. benefits are based on length of pensionable service and salary and not dependent on stock market performance) occupational pension scheme for teachers both now and for the future has been the driving force behind the approach to Teachers' Pension Scheme (TPS) reform. Sustainability is key and we believe these proposals will provide existing and new members with a high quality pension scheme that they will consider a valuable part of their remuneration package.

We listened to what you said the last time we consulted and have incorporated a number of the features that you said you wanted into the package of improvements and reforms. Many of these will be reflected in the arrangements for new entrants and the modifications to the scheme for existing members.

This consultation document seeks views on a package of reforms to the TPS in England and Wales* that has been agreed between teacher and lecturer unions, employer representatives and Government. The consultation will run until 9 August 2006 and details of how you can let us have your views are in section 5.

This review of the TPS has considered all aspects of pension provision for teachers and has sought to introduce changes that a) result in a modernised TPS with increased choice and flexibility for members; b) introduce improvements to the scheme's provisions; and c) ensure the long term financial sustainability of the scheme.

A summary of the overall package of changes for both new entrants and existing members is set out in section 3. The principles for each provision have been agreed between teacher unions, employer organisations and the DfES following productive negotiations since the Public Services Forum (PSF) meetings** in 2005.

A key element of those principles was that scheme reforms would include a pension age of 65 for new entrants. Existing scheme members could retain a pension age of 60 so long as the cost of providing that protection was met by the membership. The package of reforms set out in this document meets that requirement. All parties were, however, keen to ensure that the way in which the cost of allowing existing members to retain a pension age of 60 was dealt with equitably between existing members and new entrants. This has been achieved through an agreement under which all scheme members will pay the same contribution rate of 6.4%, but new entrants who would have a pension age of 65 would benefit from an improvement in the rate at which their pension builds (the accrual rate). Whilst existing members will retain an accrual rate of 1/80th of salary for each year of service, with a lump sum of 3 times their pension, the accrual rate for new entrants would be 1/60th of salary for each year of service, with complete flexibility over the amount of lump sum taken within the overriding limits set by Her Majesty's Revenue and Customs (HMRC).

*Separate consultations will be conducted in due course in respect of the teachers' pension schemes in Scotland and Northern Ireland where the components and costs of scheme changes could be different to those that will apply in England and Wales.

**See www.teachernet.gov.uk/pensions

The 2004 valuation of the TPS has identified a requirement for the contribution rate to increase by 0.8% from 1 January 2007. As part of the cost sharing arrangement that has been agreed with unions and employer representatives, this would be addressed through an increase in the member contribution rate of 0.2% (this is included in the total member contribution of 6.4% set out in the preceding paragraph); and an increase in the employer contribution rate of 0.6%. Both increases would take effect from 1 January 2007.

As this represents a package of improvements and reforms, it is recommended that the proposals should be considered holistically and not in isolation.

2. A Joint Statement to Members

- 2.1. This is a joint statement issued by the Department for Education and Skills (DfES), the teachers' side and the employers' side.

Teachers' side:

ACM, ASCL, ATL, AUT, NAHT, NASUWT, NATFHE, NSEAD, NUT, PAT, UCAC and UCU (from 1 June 2006, formerly AUT and NATFHE),

Employers' side:

AoC, FASNA, ISBA, ISC, NEOST, SFCF, and the UCEA.

Parallel review processes are being conducted in respect of the Teachers' Pension Schemes in Scotland and Northern Ireland. When they are concluded, similar joint statements will be issued.

(any reference to teacher/teachers includes all scheme members).

- 2.2. The Teachers' Pension Scheme (TPS) is changing. The reform package has been jointly negotiated and agreed by the DfES, the teacher and lecturer unions and the employer organisations in the context of the agreement reached in October 2005 between Government and the TUC on the framework for future pension provision in the Teachers', NHS and Civil Service pension schemes.

We believe that the package of modernising changes and improvements to the TPS will provide a fair and balanced solution to the challenges of meeting rising costs while maintaining quality of provision for both existing and future teachers, reflecting social changes and ensuring the long term sustainability and affordability of the TPS.

The importance of equal opportunities in a diverse workforce, the need to identify and address outdated features in the TPS, and the development of more flexible retirement options to meet the aspirations of older workers to make the most of their experience and expertise have all been at the heart of these reform proposals.

The significant financial contribution made to your pension by your employers demonstrates their ongoing commitment to you and their desire to continue to provide you with a first class pension scheme as part of your overall remuneration for choosing to enter and remain in the teaching profession.

The new arrangements will enable existing teachers to retain a pension age of 60. While new entrants from January 2007 will have a pension age of 65, they will benefit from a significant improvement in the rate at which their pension builds up. There will be more flexibility and greater choice over important issues such as how teachers can save and plan for retirement, allowing them to reap the benefits of being part of the TPS during their working life as well as in retirement. For example, all teachers will be able to choose a retirement date that is different from their normal pension age.

There will also be increased options for pension saving outside the main scheme and over how much tax free lump sum teachers can take on retirement, both from the TPS and the associated Teachers' AVC scheme.



Sustainability and affordability are key to ensuring the long term future of the TPS for both you and future scheme members. This will be secured through an agreement that will see members and employers sharing on an equal basis future cost pressures or savings that may arise.

The proposals to revise the TPS are the result of considerable work on your behalf by the teacher and lecturer unions, the employer organisations and the DfES; and are a major achievement for all parties concerned. We believe that the new arrangements provide a good and fair balance between the interests of teachers and taxpayers. We hope you do too and that you will let us have your comments during the formal consultation that will continue for the next 12 weeks.

3. Summary of Agreed Package of Reforms and Improvement

3.1. **The reform package agreed for *new entrants* from 1 January 2007 will include:**

- Normal Pension Age (NPA) of 65;
- Minimum Retirement Age of 55, except on grounds of ill-health;
- Pension based on $\frac{1}{60}$ th of salary for each year of pensionable service with the flexible option to take up to 25% of 'fund value' after commutation as a tax free lump sum by surrendering £1 of annual pension for £12 of lump sum;
- Benefits payable to nominated dependent partners (opposite-sex and same-sex);
- Spouses', surviving civil partners and nominated dependent partners' pensions paid for life;
- Revised ill-health retirement package – tiered approach with a higher level of benefits for total incapacity and lower level of benefits for partial incapacity;
- The better of the last year's salary or the 're-valued (in line with the Retail Price Index (RPI)) average of the best three consecutive years salary in the last ten years of service' to be used for calculating benefits at retirement;
- A facility to purchase up to £5,000 of added annual pension;
- A death grant of 3 times salary;
- Phased retirement arrangements that would enable TPS members under defined circumstances to continue working as a teacher within the TPS while drawing down some or all of their accrued pension benefits; and
- Actuarial enhancement for those who continue in work beyond NPA of 65 without accessing their pension benefits.

3.2. **For *existing members*, a NPA of 60 will be retained and the current arrangements will be modified and improved in the following ways:**

- Minimum Retirement Age of 55 by 2010 except on grounds of ill-health;
- Benefits payable to nominated dependent partners (opposite-sex and same-sex);
- Spouses', surviving civil partners and nominated dependent partners' pensions paid for life;
- The better of the last year's salary or the 're-valued (in line with RPI) average of the best three consecutive years salary in the last ten years of service' to be used for calculating benefits at retirement;
- Revised ill-health retirement package – tiered approach with a higher level of benefits for total incapacity and lower level of benefits for partial incapacity;
- More scope to take a higher tax free lump sum and a lower level of pension;
- A facility to purchase up to £5,000 of added annual pension;
- An increase in the death grant to 3 times salary; and
- Phased retirement arrangements that would enable TPS members under defined circumstances to continue working as a teacher within the TPS while drawing down some or all of their accrued pension benefits.

4.1. Timing – Implementing the new arrangements

- 4.1.1. In order to allow enough time for a full public consultation and the opportunity to take responses on board and to publicise the outcome, it is proposed that the revised pension arrangements should apply from 1 January 2007.

New entrants will be defined as those who enter the scheme with no previous pensionable service to their credit and those who return to teaching having been out of pensionable service for more than five years.

Teachers who have currently been out of pensionable service for more than five years, but who return to teaching by 31 December 2007 will do so under the existing scheme provisions irrespective of the length of break in service. Those who re-enter pensionable service after 31 December 2007, following a break of service of more than 5 years, will be subject to the provisions that apply to new entrants as set out in section 3 in respect of their future service. Benefits already accrued, however, would still be payable at age 60.

Discussions are continuing to determine the appropriate minimum period of scheme membership that must be undertaken after a break in pensionable service in order that teachers who have a subsequent break in service could return at a later date and retain NPA of 60 in respect of their future service.

There will be more flexibility and greater choice over important issues such as how teachers can save and plan for retirement, allowing them to reap the benefits of being part of the TPS during their working life as well as in retirement. For example, all teachers will be able to choose a retirement date that is different from their normal pension age.

4.1.2. **Case Studies**

a) Existing Teacher

Amerjit is 45; she joined the profession straight from university age 23. She took a break to have her children and this resulted in a four year gap in service. She has a NPA of 60 and assuming she remains in pensionable employment until she is 60, her pension calculations will be based on 33 years service. Assuming a final salary for calculation purposes of £37,000 an illustration of what her benefits may be follows.

Before commutation

Pension	$£37,000 \times 33/80 =$	£15,263
Lump Sum	(3 x pension)	£45,789

Under the new proposals she can commute an amount between the current 3/80ths and up to a maximum of 25% of the fund value into a lump sum.

This means that Amerjit could have a maximum lump sum of £81,765 i.e. an additional £35,976 on top of the 3/80ths based lump sum of £45,789.

For every £12 of additional lump sum taken, Amerjit's pension would be reduced by £1. So, if she decided to increase her lump sum by an additional £24,000 to a total of £69,789, her pension would be reduced from £15,263 a year to £13,263 a year.

b) New entrant

Paul becomes a teacher in September 2007 aged 35 years and he retires in 2037 aged 65. Assuming a final salary for calculation purposes of £40,000 (using today's values) he would be entitled to the following pension.

Before commutation

Pension £40,000 x 30/60 = £20,000.00

He can commute up to a maximum of 25% of the fund value into a lump sum. In Paul's case he could have a maximum lump sum of £85,680. For every £12 of lump sum taken, Paul's pension would be reduced by £1.

Therefore he could commute a maximum of £7,140 of his pension and receive a lump sum of about £85,680

After maximum commutation

Pension £12,860 (i.e. £20,000 minus £7,140)

Lump Sum £85,680

c) Carol has 15 years service. She is currently in the middle of a four year break working overseas. She intends to return to the classroom in April 2009, after the four year break, meaning her future service continues to accrue with a NPA of 60.

After a further year of service, making a total of 16 to April 2010, Carol joins her partner in America and is out of service until October 2016. When she returns, NPA of 65 applies to her future service, but this is with a 1/60th accrual rather than 1/80th accrual. She continues in employment for another 15 years until she is 60, at which point she retires.

For Carol, 16 years of her service are calculated using NPA of 60 (1/80th pension plus 3/80th lump sum) and 15 years at NPA of 65 (1/60th plus choice over amount of lump sum). She could take all her benefits age 60 with an actuarial reduction on the 15 years at NPA of 65 (because they are being taken early), or she could take her NPA of 60 benefits and leave the NPA of 65 benefits until she reaches 65 so that no reduction would be applied.

d) Jim, who has taken time off to look after his elderly parents but fully intends to return to teaching, hears about the changes to the TPS from reading the TES. He has already been out of service for four years. He secures a part-time contract to teach in a local school from April 2007 to November 2007. Jim eventually returns to the classroom full-time in the early part of 2009 and works to retirement. For Jim, all his service is calculated on the basis of NPA of 60.

4.2. Automatic Scheme Membership for those taking up new part-time appointments

4.2.1. Why change?

At present, part time employment is only pensionable if the individual elects to join the TPS. Making part time service pensionable automatically on appointment provides consistency of approach with those working full time. The change will encourage more people to take advantage of the TPS and the benefits it offers and to link in with wider Government pension policy on supporting individuals to maximise their pension provision.

4.2.2. Proposed position

New part-time contracts starting on or after 1 January 2007 will be automatically pensionable, unless the person has previously not opted-in to the TPS. Where an individual does not want their part time service to be pensionable, arrangements for them to opt-out of the TPS will remain in place.

4.2.3. How the proposals will affect new entrants and people in ‘excluded service’:

(Note: ‘Excluded service’ includes part-time service where no part-time election has been made to opt into the scheme and full-time service that is non-pensionable because the person has opted out.)

Both full-time and part-time new entrants will be automatically admitted to pensionable employment in the TPS if they commence employment after 1 January 2007, unless they opt-out.

For people already in excluded part-time employment on 1 January 2007, because they have not made a part-time election to join the TPS, this will continue to be non-pensionable employment after 1 January 2007 until they make a part-time election or have a change of contract.

For people who are in excluded part-time employment on 1 January 2007 because they have chosen to opt-out of the TPS this will continue to be outside the scheme even if they start a new part-time contract on or after 1 January 2007, unless, of course, they opt-in.

4.2.4. How the proposals will affect existing scheme members

Concurrent full-time and part-time employments

The pension regulations restrict pensionable service credit to 365 days per year regardless of whether the individual is concurrently undertaking full-time and part-time employment.

Once part-time service becomes automatically pensionable it will not be practical for part-time employment undertaken at the same time as full-time employment to be

automatically pensionable and it is not feasible for a person to make a partial opt-out. The new regulations will, therefore, expressly provide that part-time service that is concurrent with full-time pensionable employment will be non-pensionable.

Concurrent part-time employments

The 365 days per year limit for concurrent part-time employment will remain part of the TPS regulations. This means that it will still not be open to scheme members in multiple employment to make a partial opt-out election and only pay contributions in relation to one (or more) specific employment(s).

Retrospection

Pensionable service will apply from the first day of a contract that begins on or after 1 January 2007. Retrospective entry to the scheme for those already in part-time employment will not normally be possible. Any existing part-time teacher who has not elected to join the TPS and wishes to do so should contact their employer as soon as possible. A Communications Strategy agreed by all parties will ensure a multi-channel approach to disseminate key messages about the benefits of TPS membership.

4.3. Salary used for calculating pension benefits

4.3.1. Need for change

One of the key aims of TPS modernisation was to create a more flexible scheme and the provisions proposed will support members who want to manage the transition to retirement over a period of time.

The need for this flexibility is backed by the fact that already an increasing number of teachers are taking Actuarially Reduced Benefits (ARB) and then returning to teaching.

In addition, the existing final salary approach of using the best year in the last 3 years before the date of retirement does not take into account circumstances where a teacher's highest salary does not occur in the last three years before they retire. For example, if they have moved between sectors with a resulting reduction in salary or had ceased to receive management allowances, their most beneficial salary may fall outside the 3 year period.

While the current provisions of early retirement with ARB, stepping-down and the part-time arrangements do provide some support for those who seek a change of pace or want less responsibilities, we recognise that more could be done to support more modern working patterns by those closer to retirement. In particular, the stepping-down arrangements require specified criteria to be met and the individual to make an election at the time that they move to a less responsible post. Under these proposed arrangements, protection from a detrimental effect on pension benefits would happen automatically with no election forms or the need for any action on the part of the individual.

In addition, we want to retain the valuable skills and experience that people have accumulated throughout their careers through a more flexible approach that would enable them to continue to make a positive contribution while, for example, reducing the capacity in which they work.

4.3.2. **Proposed provision**

It is proposed that the salary used for calculating a teacher's pension would be the higher of either:

1. The member's salary in the last 12 months before retirement, or
2. The average of the revalued best three consecutive years' salaries in the 10 years prior to retirement.

4.3.3. **How the proposals will affect members**

There will be far greater individual flexibility for both existing and new members in how they manage their transition to retirement. The proposals will support flexible working arrangements and will ensure that any reductions in salary up to 10 years before retirement will not have an adverse impact on the member's pension.

These arrangements will be available to all TPS members who have service in the scheme on or after the proposed implementation date of 1 January 2007 and would be used to calculate all benefits where the current "final salary" definition is used.

Out of service members who do not return to service will continue to have their benefits calculated under the current arrangements.

The existing stepping-down arrangements will become obsolete after the new arrangements are implemented and will be withdrawn at that time. There will, however, be a two year transition period until 31 December 2008 during which the new pensionable salary arrangements will work alongside the current average salary arrangements, with the teacher receiving benefits based on whichever calculation produces the higher pension.

4.3.4. **Case Studies**

The following case studies illustrate how the proposal will affect a couple of people with different career patterns, comparing the proposed and current provisions.

- a) A teacher has enjoyed a traditional career path. Their salary has increased year on year and their pension is based on their salary in the twelve months prior to retirement. Under this scenario the teacher will receive exactly the same level of benefits under the proposed arrangements as they would under the current arrangements.

b) A classroom teacher had an allowance (e.g. a management allowance), which they lost a number of years before they retired. Under the current arrangements, the allowance would not count towards their pension, as it was paid more than three years prior to retirement. However, under the proposed arrangements, the teacher's pension would be based on the average of the highest three consecutive years. In this case, assuming the member had 35 years service, their pension would be based on 35/80ths of £42,654 (the revalued average of earnings in years 2, 3 and 4). Without this change in approach, their benefits would have been based on 35/80ths of £41,154. The teacher will, as a result of this change, receive an additional lump sum of £1,968 and additional annual pension of £656.

Illustrative patterns of pensionable earnings in case studies a and b

	Year 1	Year 2	Year 3	Year 4	Year 5	Year 6	Year 7	Year 8	Year 9	Year 10	Current	Proposed
a	30,000	30,900	31,827	32,782	33,765	34,778	35,822	36,896	38,003	39,143	39,143	39,143
b	35,000	36,050	37,132	38,245	35,500	36,565	37,662	38,792	39,956	41,154	41,154	42,654

(assumes inflation at 2% and salary increase at 3%)

4.4. Buying additional pension benefits

4.4.1. Proposed position

To encourage members to have greater control over their retirement options, these proposals will introduce more flexible and appropriate arrangements for buying additional pension benefit compared to the existing past and current added years (PAY/CAY) provisions. This will be achieved by enabling members, or their employers on their behalf, to buy additional annual pension of up to £5000 a year. This represents a significant proportion of the average pension that is payable to those currently retiring from the TPS.

By contrast, the existing PAY provisions only allow individuals to cover earlier gaps in service. They do not allow individuals to forward plan by enhancing their pension benefits in anticipation of, for example, taking a later break in service or moving to part time working.

As well as the obvious benefits for members, this new flexibility will help employers manage their workforce and use the purchase of additional pension benefits as part of their recruitment, retention and motivation arrangements.

4.4.2. How the proposals will affect existing members and new entrants

- The proposed new arrangements for buying additional pension benefit will be introduced for both existing members and new entrants from 1 January 2007 and will replace the current PAY and CAY options;
- Existing PAY/CAY elections will be honoured;

- Members will be able to buy up to £5,000 additional annual pension at any time whilst in pensionable employment;
- Additional pension benefits can be bought in multiples of £250 units;
- The value of additional pension benefits would be index-linked before and after they come into payment. Further discussions are taking place on how that would be applied;
- Members will be able to buy additional pension benefits with a lump sum or by spreading the payments over a number of years (subject to this and other employee contributions in any year not exceeding annual earnings in that year). Whatever method is chosen, members should receive tax relief on their contributions;
- Members will have increased choice as they will be able to purchase personal benefits only or personal and dependants' benefits;
- Where additional pension benefits are bought by regular payments over a number of years the cost charged would be reviewed periodically;
- The costs of buying additional pension benefits by either a lump sum payment or by instalments are currently being assessed by the Government Actuary. It is hoped that these will be available during the consultation period so that they can be included in the information available on the website www.teachernet.gov.uk/pensions along with some illustrative case studies.

4.5. Phased retirement

4.5.1. Need for change

Giving teachers the opportunity to wind down towards retirement by gradually reducing the number of hours worked and/or the level of responsibility undertaken is a key aim of this proposal.

We recognise that the traditional approach to retirement, where an individual goes from being in full-time employment to being in full-time retirement over the space of a weekend, no longer meets the needs and expectations of many people and their employers.

More and more teachers are looking at ways in which they can have greater control over how, and the timescale in which, they move into final retirement. Access to TPS scheme benefits is currently only possible if the member actually retires and then they have to take all main scheme pension benefits at the same time.

While there are some limited provisions in the existing TPS that support a more flexible approach, awareness of these is poor and the provisions are often thought to be too complex. Examples of existing arrangements are:

- The pension benefits of part-time teachers are calculated using the full-time equivalent salary;
- Stepping down arrangements which, subject to certain conditions, protect pension earned when a person's contributable salary is reduced. (These arrangements will be withdrawn on or before 1 January 2007);

- Actuarially reduced pensions are not abated by future earnings. This has enabled teachers to draw their pension benefits early, supplement their income by undertaking further teaching or lecturing often in a less demanding role or on a part-time or supply basis, and continue to build further pension benefits.

As part of the changes to the tax regime that governs occupational pension schemes from April 2006, scheme rules can be amended to allow members to draw some or all of their occupational pension benefits from the age of 55 without having to retire completely from that employment. This opportunity to build on existing flexibilities is one that we believe employers and members will support, as it should help to:

- Improve work life balance
- Improve the retention of experienced staff with valuable skills
- Extend working lives

4.5.2. **Proposed position**

Under the proposals a facility would be introduced into the TPS for phased retirement with pension drawdown for all members. This would be available to those who wish to continue in work in a reduced capacity (by moving to part-time working or by relinquishing some responsibilities), but would want to supplement their reduced income by drawing down some of their pension benefits.

The detailed proposals are:

- ‘Reduced capacity’ will require a minimum reduction in pensionable income of 25% that would last for at least 12 months;
- Up to 100% of benefits (pension and lump sum) can be taken;
- Draw down of pension benefits can be on two separate occasions before final retirement;
- Benefits taken before NPA would be subject to actuarial reduction;
- No qualifying period will be needed in respect of further service;
- No abatement on pension drawdown where payments have been actuarially reduced. This means your pension payments will not be reduced even if the total of your pension and future earnings exceeds your previous earnings;
- Benefits from residual service, the part of the pension entitlement that has not been drawn down on early, can be taken later as a deferred payment or can be combined with future service; and
- Options for phased retirement offered to all members in service.

We would like your views on whether and how out of service members might be able to take some (rather than all) of their benefits on an actuarially reduced basis while leaving the rest to be drawn on at their NPA.

4.5.3. **Case Study**

James joins the TPS at age 22 with a normal pension age of 60. He reduces his hours to half-time from age 56 and his annual salary drops from £46,008 to £23,004. He continues to work for another 4 years and accrues more service.

In 2007 at age 56 he will have accrued 34 years service and will take 50% as pension at this time. This will be subject to **actuarial reduction**.

Pension

$£46,008 \times 17/80 = £9,776.70 \times 0.786$ (ARB factor) = **£7,684.48** plus an ongoing salary of £23,004

and lump sum

$£46,008 \times 17/80 \times 3 = £29,330.10 \times 0.872$ (ARB factor) = **£25,575.84**

He works for another four years and at age 60 retires completely. Final salary, assumed for calculation purposes, at age 60 is £24,411. The extra 4 years service (at half-time) is the equivalent of 2 years of full-time service and that service is combined with the residual service not previously drawn down.

On retirement at age 60 he draws the rest of his pension;

Pension

$£24,411 \times 2 = £48,822 \times (17+2)/80 =$ **£11,595.22 pension** (no ARB)

and lump sum

$£48,822 \times 19/80 \times 3 =$ **£34,785.66**

(The first part of the pension drawn in 2007 would increase in value each year in April in line with inflation.)

4.6. Surviving partner benefits

4.6.1. Need for change

All parties recognise that the modernisation of the TPS should include making provision for scheme members to nominate formally dependant partners (opposite-sex and same-sex) to receive a survivor pension. It is proposed that this facility should be introduced from 1 January 2007 within the framework set out below.

4.6.2. Nomination criteria

The member must nominate his or her partner in a prescribed format and they must complete a joint declaration of partnership stating that;

- i) The member and his or her partner are living together in an exclusive committed long-term relationship (i.e. a permanent relationship with just one person) that has existed for at least two years;
- ii) The member and his or her partner are legally free to marry or would have been able to if he or she and his or her partner had not been of the same sex (i.e. neither the member or the partner can be married to or be in a registered civil partnership with anyone else);

- iii) Either the member's partner is financially dependent on the member or they are financially interdependent.

The partner would be asked to provide evidence that the above criteria continued to be met at the time of member's death. The type of evidence that would be required is set out below.

4.6.3. **Financial dependency**

In order to complete the financial dependency test, evidence would need to be provided at the point of the member's death. This could include:

- Confirmation that they lived together in a shared household;
- Confirmation of shared household spending;
- Children of the member and/or partner being jointly brought up;
- Shared bank accounts or investments;
- A loan or mortgage in joint names;
- Wills naming each other as the main beneficiary;
- A mutual power of attorney;
- The partner being nominated as the main beneficiary of life insurance;
- The death of the member leading to substantive extra living expenses for the partner.

This list is not exhaustive and the evidence will not have to contain all the elements listed above.

4.6.4. **How the proposals will affect existing members and new entrants**

- Surviving partner benefits would be introduced for both existing members and new entrants from 1 January 2007;
- Pensionable employment undertaken on or after 1 January 2007 will count towards surviving partner benefit and, as with widower's and civil partner's pensions, there will be a two year qualifying period;
- A consequence of the introduction of benefits for surviving partners is that the existing provisions under which widow(er) pensions are stopped following re-marriage or co-habitation need to be reviewed. We, therefore, propose that for members who retire on or after 1 January 2007, dependants' (including widow(er)s') benefits will be payable for life i.e. not stopped on remarriage or co-habitation;
- The accrual rate for surviving partner benefits will be 1/160th, regardless of the accrual rate that applies to the member's own pension, for both existing and new entrants from 1 January 2007;
- Existing members will be able to buy in pre-1 January 2007 service for a surviving partner benefit at full cost.

4.7. Ill health retirement benefits

4.7.1 Need for change

Helping employees stay healthy at work and reducing the incidence of ill-health retirement is an aim shared by the Department, unions and employers.

The Treasury Review of Ill-Health Retirement in the Public Sector, published in July 2000 set out a range of recommendations to public sector schemes including recommending different levels of benefits for members depending on the severity of their condition and the likelihood of them being able to work again. This recommendation has been accepted by Treasury and DfES Ministers and is reflected in the DfES's Ill-Health Retirement action plan and in the proposed reform of the TPS.

4.7.2. Proposed position

In order to ensure that the benefit structure better reflects the position of those most in need, a tiered approach with a higher level of benefits for total incapacity and a lower level of benefits for partial incapacity would be introduced from 1 January 2007, for both new entrants and existing scheme members.

Total Incapacity Benefit (TIB) would be granted to those members who would only be capable of work that would be greatly below the overall job weight of a teacher and Partial Incapacity Benefit (PIB) for those permanently incapable of teaching, but capable of a range of other types of work.

So while the requirement for permanent incapacity from teaching would remain, the severity of the medical condition and its impact on the future earnings capacity of the member would determine the scheme member's level of benefit when retiring on the grounds of ill health.

TIB would include a half prospective service enhancement to normal pension age. Under PIB there is no service enhancement, but the member would not be subject to the reduction normally applied to benefits because of early payment. Also the benefit will not be reviewed if the member becomes employed in any capacity outside teaching.

The existing appeals system would be extended to cover those appealing against the award of the lower level of benefit as well as those appealing against a rejection of their application for ill-health retirement.

People who are not in pensionable employment in the TPS but have a continuing contractual relationship with their employer through, for example, maternity and paternity leave or are on an employer supported career break, would be treated the same as if they were in pensionable employment in terms of eligibility for TIB or PIB.

Out of service scheme members will not be entitled to ill-health retirement benefits unless they develop a medical condition that would meet the TIB criteria. In these circumstances they will be awarded unreduced benefits based on their actual reckonable service, but with no enhancement.

In addition, out of service applicants will be treated as existing members if the application is made within 6 months of leaving pensionable employment and there is evidence that they left pensionable employment due to incapacity. The level of enhancement would depend on the person's NPA.

The working of the new arrangements will be jointly reviewed by union, employer and DfES representatives during 2008.

4.7.3. **Case Studies**

- a) A 56 year old secondary school teacher is suffering from depression/anxiety. If the cause of the depression was specific to teaching and the teacher was fit to work in another occupation, a PIB would be appropriate. Only if the symptoms were so severe that the teacher would not be fit for any gainful employment, could a TIB be justified.
- b) A 37 year old primary school teacher with 14 years service (who was a new entrant after 1 January 2007) has been diagnosed with generalised osteo-arthritis. Assuming the permanent incapacity for teaching criteria has been met and the level of debility is such that she would not be fit for any other form of gainful employment, TIB would be granted. In this case an enhancement of half prospective service to age 65 (14 years) would be awarded, (only 6 2/3 years enhancement would be granted under the current arrangements) meaning that her benefits would be based on 28 years service.

4.8. **Possible additional flexibilities**

4.8.1. **Case for change**

On 6 April 2006, the tax regime governing occupational pension schemes changed. However, there is no requirement on schemes to introduce any of these new flexibilities and it is a matter for the managers of each scheme to decide whether, and if so to what extent, new flexibilities should be introduced.

The guiding principle is that flexibilities can be considered for introduction into public service schemes provided:

- a) they support a legitimate policy aim;
- b) any costs are contained within the available cost envelope or met by an increase in the member contribution rate; and
- c) they are part of a package of reforms that addresses the affordability and sustainability of the public service scheme.

Further discussion will take place during the consultation period to work through outstanding details in respect of all topics, but in particular those flexibilities arising from changes in HMRC legislation and the introduction of an additional pension purchase arrangement.

These issues include:

- whether the existing 15% limit on contributions to the TPS should be retained, lifted or removed;
- the proposed limit of £5,000 for purchasing additional pension;
- other operational aspects and consequences of introducing an additional pension purchase arrangement;
- the possibility that out of service members might also be entitled to take some of their benefits on an actuarially reduced basis while leaving the rest to be drawn on or before their NPA (at present, out of service members have to take all of their benefits at the same time);
- the retention or removal of the earnings cap that applies to those who joined the TPS after 31 May 1989 and whose pensionable earnings are restricted to £108,600;
- the retention or removal of the 40 and 45 year limits on pensionable service;
- the retention of or increase in the age 70 limit on TPS membership.

4.9. Premature retirement and severance arrangements

4.9.1. Case for change

The existing statutory provisions which apply to post-92 Higher Education (HE) Institutions do not apply to pre-92 HE institutions. In response to a request from the HE employer association, UCEA, steps will be taken to provide greater consistency in relation to premature retirement and severance arrangements in all HE institutions.

As the existing severance arrangements for some TPS members are directly age and service related they need to be reviewed by 1 October 2006, in order to check compliance with age discrimination legislation that will come into effect on that date. It remains appropriate for all staff in an institution, whether they are in the TPS or the Local Government Pension Scheme (LGPS), to be subject to the same severance payment arrangements.

4.9.2. Proposed position

The HE sector will be exempted from the overarching regulatory framework for premature retirement and severance to ensure consistency across both pre and post-92 HE Institutions. It will be a matter for individual HE institutions to determine the terms under which premature retirement and severance (subject to overriding legislation on statutory redundancy requirements) will be granted.

Severance provisions will be amended as necessary to ensure that they comply with the requirements of the age discrimination legislation. Where appropriate, there will be

consistency with arrangements that will apply to non teaching staff in schools and colleges that are covered by the Local Government Pension Scheme.

Any changes will apply to both new entrants and existing members.

4.10. Contribution Rates

4.10.1. The effect of combining scheme reforms and improvements with retention of NPA 60 for existing members will require an increase of 0.2% in the contribution rate for all members. In addition, in order to secure the sustainability of the TPS:

- the member contribution rate would increase by a further 0.2% as the members' share of the outcome of the 2004 TPS valuation taking it to 6.4%;
- the employer contribution rate would increase by 0.6% following the 2004 valuation taking it to 14.1%;
- there would be an equal division between members and employers of any cost increases or savings that may result from future valuations;
- there would be a ceiling of 14% on the employer contribution rate that would take effect from the 2008 valuation onwards;
- the equal division of cost increases or savings and the ceiling of 14% on the employer contribution rate would be reviewed in the light of any changes in the total contribution rate that arise from factors other than demographic experience, for example overriding legislative requirements.

4.10.2. Taking the above into account, from 1 January 2007:

- The employer contribution rate will rise from 13.5% to 14.1%; and
- The member contribution rate will rise from 6% to 6.4%.

Following discussion between employers and the DfES about affordability, further information will also be provided to employers in the maintained schools' sector about the immediate financial impact on school budgets of the increase in the employer contribution rate from 1 January 2007 in the context of the increases for 2006-07 and 2007-08 in Dedicated Schools Grant and Schools Standards Grant (SSG) announced in December 2005, and the further allocations to secondary and primary schools of SSG (personalisation) announced in Budget 2006. We would welcome views on this issue in the responses to this consultation.

5. How to Respond

5.1 On-line

You can respond on-line by selecting the 'Respond on-line' option at the beginning of the consultation webpage.

5.2 Other options

There is also an option on the first webpage to download copies of the consultation document and questionnaire. The questionnaire can be returned as a hard copy by post to: Department for Education and Skills, Consultation Unit, Area 2A, Castle View House, Ease Lane, Runcorn, Cheshire WA7 2GJ or by email to consultation.unit@dfes.gsi.gov.uk

6. Additional Copies

6.1 You can download this publication or order online at www.teachernet.gov.uk/publications

Search using the ref: 0497-2006BKT-EN

Copies of this publication can be also obtained from:
DfES Publications, PO Box 5050, Sherwood Park, Annesley, Nottingham NG15 0DJ.

Tel: 0845 60 222 60

Fax: 0845 60 333 60

Textphone: 0845 60 555 60

email: dfes@prolog.uk.com

Please quote ref: 0497-2006BKT-EN

ISBN No: 1-84478-757-5

PP/D16(6675)/0506/22

© Crown copyright 2006

Produced by the Department for Education and Skills

Extracts from this document may be reproduced for non commercial education or training purposes on the condition that the source is acknowledged.

7. Plans for making results public

7.1 A summary of the responses to this consultation will be published on the DfES website in autumn 2006.

8. Consultation Response Form

The closing date for this consultation is: 9 August 2006

Your comments must reach us by that date

The information you provide in your response will be subject to the Freedom of Information Act 2000 and Environmental Information Regulations, which allow public access to information held by the Department. This does not necessarily mean that your response can be made available to the public as there are exemptions relating to information provided in confidence and information to which the Data Protection Act 1998 applies. You may request confidentiality by ticking the box provided, but you should note that neither this, nor an automatically-generated e-mail confidentiality statement, will necessarily exclude the public right of access.

Please tick if you want us to keep your response confidential.

Name

Organisation (if applicable)

Address:

If your enquiry is related to the policy content of the consultation you can contact
The Pensions and Medical Fitness Team, Department for Education and Skills at:

e-mail: **PMFT.MAILBOX@dfes.gsi.gov.uk**

If you have a query relating to the consultation process you can contact the Consultation Unit on:

Telephone: 01928 794888

Fax: 01928 794 311

e-mail: **consultation.unit@dfes.gsi.gov.uk**

1 Timing - implementing the new arrangements (section 4.1).

Do you have any comments on this section?

Comments:

2 Automatic scheme membership (section 4.2).

Do you have comments on this section?

Comments:

3 Salary used for calculating pension benefits (section 4.3).

Do you have any comments on this section?

Comments:

4 Buying additional pension benefits (section 4.4).

Do you have any comments on this section?

Comments:

5 Phased retirement (section 4.5).

Do you have any comments on this section?

Comments:

6 Surviving partner benefits (section 4.6).

Do you have any comments on this section?

Comments:

7 Ill-health retirement benefits (section 4.7).

Do you have any comments on this section?

Comments:

8 Possible additional flexibilities (section 4.8).

Do you have any comments on this section?

Comments:

9 Premature retirement and severance (section 4.9).

Do you have any comments on this section?

Comments:

10 Contribution rates (section 4.10).

Do you have any comments on this section?

Comments:



11 We would welcome any further comments you may have.

Comments:



12 Please let us have your views on responding to this consultation

(e.g. the number and type of questions, was it easy to find, understand and complete? etc.)

Comments:



Thank you for taking the time to let us have your views. We do not intend to acknowledge individual responses unless you place an 'X' in the box below.

Please acknowledge this reply

Here at the Department for Education and Skills we carry out our research on many different topics and consultations. As your views are valuable to us, would it be alright if we were to contact you again from time to time either for research or to send through consultation documents?

Yes No

All UK national public consultations are required to conform to the following standards:

1. Consult widely throughout the process, allowing a minimum of 12 weeks for written consultation at least once during the development of the policy.
2. Be clear about what your proposals are, who may be affected, what questions are being asked and the timescale for responses.
3. Ensure that your consultation is clear, concise and widely accessible.
4. Give feedback regarding the responses received and how the consultation process influenced the policy.
5. Monitor your department's effectiveness at consultation, including through the use of a designated consultation co-ordinator.
6. Ensure your consultation follows better regulation best practice, including carrying out a Regulatory Impact Assessment if appropriate.

Further information on the Code of Practice can be accessed through the Cabinet Office Website: <http://www.cabinetoffice.gov.uk/regulation/consultation-guidance/content/introduction/index.asp>

Thank you for taking time to respond to this consultation.

Completed questionnaires and other responses should be sent to the address shown below by 24 August 2006

Send by post to: Department for Education and Skills, Consultation Unit, Castle View House, East Lane, Runcorn, WA7 2GJ.

Send by e-mail to: **consultation.unit@dfes.gsi.gov.uk**

You can download this publication or order online at

www.teachernet.gov.uk/publications

Search using the ref: 0497-2006BKT-EN

Copies of this publication can be also obtained from:

DfES Publications

PO Box 5050

Sherwood Park

Annesley

Nottingham NG15 0DJ.

Tel: 0845 60 222 60

Fax: 0845 60 333 60

Textphone: 0845 60 555 60

email: dfes@prolog.uk.com

Please quote ref: 0497-2006BKT-EN

ISBN No: 1-84478-757-5

PP/D16(6675)/0506/22

© Crown copyright 2006

Produced by the Department for Education and Skills

Extracts from this document may be reproduced for non commercial education or training purposes on the condition that the source is acknowledged.

department for

education and skills

creating opportunity, releasing potential, achieving excellence